

## APPENDIX E – COMMENTS AND RESPONSES REPORT

Table 1: List of Registered Interested and Affected Parties – Hollingrove Development

Registered Interested and Affected Parties – Hollingrove Development								
	First name	Surname	Organisation	Address	Email	Cell	Phone	Fax
1	Kathy and Nigel	Arnold		Langholm Farm, PO Box 55, Bathurst, 6166	<a href="mailto:kathy@langholm.co.za">kathy@langholm.co.za</a>	0833254835	0466228338	
2	Donovan and Madeleine	Murray		(allegedly bordering Hollingrove)	<a href="mailto:maddon@intekom.co.za">maddon@intekom.co.za</a>			
3			Bathurst West Farmers Association	PO Box 2690, Port Alfred	<a href="mailto:kasouga@intekom.co.za">kasouga@intekom.co.za</a>		0466482245	
4	Jenny and Peter	Lane		Denver (Portion 2 of Hollingrove)	<a href="mailto:jemi@icon.co.za">jemi@icon.co.za</a>	0829000016		
5	Fred	Tyson		Gracelands	<a href="mailto:ftyson@pga.org.za">ftyson@pga.org.za</a>	0824407437	0466223057	0466223057
6	SW	Tyson		Gracelands	<a href="mailto:ftyson@pga.org.za">ftyson@pga.org.za</a>		0466223057	0466223057
7	Adrian and Cathy	Pote		Halfway House	<a href="mailto:ajpote@vodamail.co.za">ajpote@vodamail.co.za</a>		0466228471	
8	Greg	Timm		Portion of Hollingrove		0828233967		0466228186
9	Shepherd	Npengesi	EC Parks Board	Waters Meeting Nature Reserve	<a href="mailto:mpengesi@ecparks.co.za">mpengesi@ecparks.co.za</a>	0794967915	0466250876	0466250958
10	Sacha	Peinke	Waters meeting ecologist	6 St Marks Road, Southernwood, East London 5213	<a href="mailto:Sacha.Peinke@ecparks.co.za">Sacha.Peinke@ecparks.co.za</a>	0798902243		
11	Bev	Geach	EASTERN CAPE PARKS Scientific Services	PO Box 11235, Southernwood, 5213	<a href="mailto:bev.geach@ecparks.co.za">bev.geach@ecparks.co.za</a>	0823044220	043 742 2557 (ext 109)	0866119208

**COMMENTS AND RESPONSE TRAIL:**

Date	Interested and affected party	Comment	Response
08-Apr-08	<b>Sheperd Npengesi (Waters meeting)</b>	Mr Npengesi enquired about exact position of Hollingrove development as he had seen the site notice on the gate leading into the state forest.	CES indicated that the site notice was placed on the state forest gate so that more people would see the notice but that the Hollingrove Share Block development was on the Southwell road side of the Kowie River and as such, not in the state forest.
08-Apr-08	<b>Sheperd Npengesi (Waters meeting)</b>	Mr Npengesi enquired about the use of the state forest road during the construction phase of the project.	CES explained that the state forest road use would be kept to a minimum as the Southwell road would be used for the majority of the clusters construction. Only cluster "E" and "A" would be constructed with materials brought to the site through the state forest. The road is a registered servitude for the Hollingrove farm as well as the neighbours of the Hollingrove farm.
09-Apr-08	<b>Kathy Arnold (neighbour)</b>	Mrs Arnold enquired about the use of the state forest road during the construction phase of the project.	CES explained that the state forest road use would be kept to a minimum as the Southwell road would be used for the majority of the clusters construction. Only cluster "E" and "A" would be constructed with materials brought to the site through the state forest. The road is a registered servitude for the Hollingrove farm as well as the neighbours of the Hollingrove farm.

10-Apr-08	Jenny Lane (neighbour)	Ms Lane enquired whether or not any of the clusters will be overlooking her 183 hectare farm to the west of the Kowie River but East of Hollingrove. ie North East of property bordering on the Kowie River,	CES offered to send through the latest map for her to see if there are any clusters or buildings which would impacts the aesthetics of their farm. Ie influence the skyline or over look the Lane property. Map was sent on the 10 April 2008. As far as she could see there were no clusters overlooking her farm. (Jenny Lane quote: "As far as I can see there shouldn't be any problem with them overlooking us.")
11-Apr-08	Jenny Lane (neighbour)	Ms Lane enquired: "Another matter that would concern us is the use of the municipal road (from The Grahamstown Rd to the Southwell Rd) by the vastly increased amount of residents. By having so many vehicles using the road, who would be responsible for its maintenance? Part of the road goes through our property and even though we hardly use it, it is an access to the Hollingrove estate and we would hate it to become unusable! As it stands, there is already a bit of erosion taking place - and we have only used it about 6 times in the last six years to show people the view over our farm. I do know that the owners of Hollingrove do use the road quite a bit (and since their usage it has deteriorated a bit)- and at present there are only 3 of them. If you could look into this it would be great."	<b>Louis Fourie, Professional Engineer</b> replied: "my understanding is that this road is a public road and that the local authority is supposed to be responsible for the maintenance on this road. On the other hand, it is not legal to do any construction/maintenance work on a public road"
23 Mar 09	<b>Delegate of Minster: Land use and Soil Management</b>	With reference to the proposed consolidation, rezoning and subdivision of Portion 7 of farm no. 179, remainder of Portion 1, Portion 4 and Portion 5, all of the farm no. 180, Ndlambe Municipality, Eastern Cape Province, I wish to inform you that this Department has no objections against the proposed consolidation of the above mentioned properties an the rezoning of a portion measuring approximately 2.9 hectares thereof to Resort Zone II from an agricultural point of view on condition that the potion be coupled back to the rest of the property. <b>See attached letter below.</b>	<b>Noted</b>

<p>12-Jun-09</p>	<p><b>Dave Balfour (EC Parks Board)</b>  <b>Faxed correspondence</b></p>	<p>Dr Balfour on behalf of the Eastern Cape Parks Board (ECPB), the managing authority of the Waters Meeting Nature Reserve, objected to the proposed usage of the road across the nature reserve as an access route for portions of the development. This objection was supported by the following comments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Eastern Cape Parks have not been provided adequate proof that the road is a registered servitude.</li> <li>2. The nature of the proposed usage is very different from alleged historical use &amp; thus historical rights cannot be viewed as transferable.</li> <li>3. The increase in traffic volume will negatively impact biodiversity (both directly and indirectly- through reallocation of budget and staff to manage the access route)</li> <li>4. An alternative access route exists- the use of which would significantly mitigate the impact on the protected area</li> <li>5. Actual usage on the road is not adequately estimated</li> <li>6. Nature of the proposed lodge is not disclosed &amp; thus usage by visitors can not be adequately estimated</li> <li>7. It is not clear how clusters other than the 3 indicated in the report will be restricted from using the access road</li> <li>8. The condition of the road is not compatible with proposed usage &amp; thus upgrading will be required, with further budgetary reallocation to non-conservation activities</li> <li>9. It is not appropriate to allow usage of the access road by vehicles during construction or service vehicles during operation.<b>(see attached letter below)</b></li> </ol>	<p>The title deed for Hollingrove farm indicates that the access road across the nature reserve is a registered servitude (please see attached title deed for proof) and provides access for the Hollingrove reserve as well as their neighbours. Additionally, the road is also a registered Main Road for public use (see attached road network map)</p> <p>The road will only be used for cluster A, the cluster nearest the forest gate. All other clusters will use the Southwell access road. The Southwell road will also be used for refuse collection etc. As this is will be a privately owned resort, the road traffic will be minimal, with less traffic than when it was used as a commercial cattle farm. Within cluster A, with the exception of Mr Eaden Young being a permanent resident, all other owners will use the property primarily as holiday homes, i.e. about once a year.</p> <p>Construction vehicles will use the state road, however, as no massive building operations are planned, this usage will be no more than already used</p> <p>The proposed usage will in no way affect the already derelict, badly constructed roads through the state reserve, in fact the opposite, as the Hollingrove owners will contribute to the upkeep. It is already badly eroded.</p>
------------------	--	--	--

			<p>The proposed usage of the state road is highly unlikely to have any impact on animal fatalities or cause any major disruptions. Again, this will be a privately owned resort, with the majority of the owners using the state road intermittently.</p> <p>The aesthetic appearance of the homes are all “eco-friendly”, using thatch, brick, stone and timber. Additionally, the homes are all designed to be below the skyline and blend in with the environment (see Appendix C for facility illustrations).</p> <p>All animals introduced will be strictly indigenous species, and the manager will maintain an accurate record of all game on the reserve. <b>(see response attached below)</b></p>
--	--	--	--